

# Exhibit 9

**From:** [Heaven, Astor](#)  
**To:** [Goldstein, Kevin](#)  
**Cc:** [SVanHorn@jenner.com](#); [Aslade@crowell.com](#); [Murphy, Jerome](#); [JHoffman@jenner.com](#); ["GFuentes@jenner.com"](#) ([GFuentes@jenner.com](#)); [Hemlock, Adam](#); [Rozga, Kaj](#)  
**Subject:** Re: CRT Litigation - ViewSonic  
**Date:** Thursday, November 13, 2014 9:23:23 PM  
**Attachments:** [image001.jpg](#)

---

Kevin-

The letter wasn't meant to contradict anything I told you on the phone. As I stated in the letter, to the extent documents existed, we produced them. And you have the documents if they exist. We will be serving verifications shortly. Finally, please send a stip.

Best,  
Astor

Astor H.L. Heaven  
(o) 202-624-2599  
(c) 301-237-7805

On Nov 13, 2014, at 8:52 PM, "Goldstein, Kevin"  
<[Kevin.Goldstein@weil.com](mailto:Kevin.Goldstein@weil.com)<<mailto:Kevin.Goldstein@weil.com>>> wrote:

Astor,

Your letter states that ViewSonic's production included "OEM Agreements, purchase orders, and other communications regarding Matsushita." We have not located any purchase orders regarding Matsushita in the production. Can you please point us to some examples?

Additionally, you reference OEM Agreements in the plural. The only OEM Agreement regarding Matsushita we are aware of is the document Bates stamped beginning VIEW\_CRT00041042. Further, Interrogatory No. 18 of Panasonic Corporation's First Set of Interrogatories to ViewSonic Corporation required ViewSonic to identify all OEM Agreements relating to Panasonic Defendants or their affiliates, and ViewSonic's response identified only that single document VIEW\_CRT00041042 regarding Matsushita (and some other OEM Agreements with companies plainly unrelated to Matsushita). If you believe that ViewSonic's interrogatory response is deficient and there are other OEM Agreements regarding Matsushita, please identify them. On a related note, can you confirm whether verifications have been served for ViewSonic's various interrogatory responses served September 15, 2014, November 7, 2014 and earlier today? Verifications do not appear to have been received.

Please also identify the communications regarding Matsushita referenced in your letter. Although we note a few documents that contain references to Matsushita, they appear to be almost exclusively spreadsheets, along with a few third-party public market reports and documents related to LCD products not at issue in this litigation. There does not appear to be any record of ViewSonic's purchasing negotiations with Matsushita or any direct communication between ViewSonic and Matsushita.

Regarding the privilege log, discovery is closed in this case and ViewSonic's privilege log should have been produced already. Should there be any issues with ViewSonic's forthcoming privilege log, we wish to reserve the right to seek appropriate relief from the court. Please let us know as soon as possible if ViewSonic will agree to stipulate extending the time for Defendants to move to compel or seek other relief related to documents that have been withheld on the basis of privilege. We will draft up a proposed stipulation and send to you shortly. If a stipulation cannot be agreed, we will be forced to seek relief from the court tomorrow.

Best,  
Kevin

<[image001.jpg](#)>

Kevin B. Goldstein

Weil, Gotshal & Manges LLP  
1300 Eye Street NW, Suite 900  
Washington, DC 20005  
kevin.goldstein@weil.com<<mailto:kevin.goldstein@weil.com>>  
+1 202 682 7033 Direct  
+1 847 571 7766 Mobile  
+1 202 857 0940 Fax

\*Admitted in New York only. Practicing under the Supervision of Members of the D.C. Bar.

From: Heaven, Astor [<mailto:AHeaven@crowell.com>]  
Sent: Thursday, November 13, 2014 6:53 PM  
To: Goldstein, Kevin  
Cc: SVanHorn@jenner.com<<mailto:SVanHorn@jenner.com>>;  
Aslade@crowell.com<<mailto:Aslade@crowell.com>>; Murphy, Jerome;  
JHoffman@jenner.com<<mailto:JHoffman@jenner.com>>;  
'GFuentes@jenner.com<<mailto:GFuentes@jenner.com>'  
(GFuentes@jenner.com<<mailto:GFuentes@jenner.com>>); Hemlock, Adam; Rozga, Kaj  
Subject: CRT Litigation - ViewSonic

Kevin-

Please see the attached correspondence.

Best,  
Astor

---

Astor H.L. Heaven  
aheaven@crowell.com<<mailto:aheaven@crowell.com>>  
Direct 1.202.624.2599 | Cell 1.301.237.7805

Crowell & Moring LLP | [www.crowell.com<<http://www.crowell.com/>>](http://www.crowell.com/)  
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue NW  
Washington, DC 20004

---

The information contained in this email message is intended only for use of the individual or entity named above. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please immediately notify us by email, [postmaster@weil.com<<mailto:postmaster@weil.com>>](mailto:postmaster@weil.com), and destroy the original message. Thank you.